

Notice of Allowability	Application No.	Applicant(s)
	10/695,707	KIRSHENBAUM, EVAN R.
	Examiner Michael B. Holmes	Art Unit 2121

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address--

All claims being allowable, PROSECUTION ON THE MERITS IS (OR REMAINS) CLOSED in this application. If not included herewith (or previously mailed), a Notice of Allowance (PTOL-85) or other appropriate communication will be mailed in due course. **THIS NOTICE OF ALLOWABILITY IS NOT A GRANT OF PATENT RIGHTS.** This application is subject to withdrawal from issue at the initiative of the Office or upon petition by the applicant. See 37 CFR 1.313 and MPEP 1308.

1. This communication is responsive to November 17, 2006.
2. The allowed claim(s) is/are 1-30.
3. Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
 - a) All
 - b) Some*
 - c) None
 of the:
 1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this national stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* Certified copies not received: _____.

Applicant has THREE MONTHS FROM THE "MAILING DATE" of this communication to file a reply complying with the requirements noted below. Failure to timely comply will result in ABANDONMENT of this application.
THIS THREE-MONTH PERIOD IS NOT EXTENDABLE.

4. A SUBSTITUTE OATH OR DECLARATION must be submitted. Note the attached EXAMINER'S AMENDMENT or NOTICE OF INFORMAL PATENT APPLICATION (PTO-152) which gives reason(s) why the oath or declaration is deficient.
5. CORRECTED DRAWINGS (as "replacement sheets") must be submitted.
 - (a) including changes required by the Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) attached
 - 1) hereto or 2) to Paper No./Mail Date _____.
 - (b) including changes required by the attached Examiner's Amendment / Comment or in the Office action of Paper No./Mail Date _____.

Identifying indicia such as the application number (see 37 CFR 1.84(c)) should be written on the drawings in the front (not the back) of each sheet. Replacement sheet(s) should be labeled as such in the header according to 37 CFR 1.121(d).
6. DEPOSIT OF and/or INFORMATION about the deposit of BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL must be submitted. Note the attached Examiner's comment regarding REQUIREMENT FOR THE DEPOSIT OF BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL.

Attachment(s)

1. Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
2. Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
3. Information Disclosure Statements (PTO/SB/08),
Paper No./Mail Date _____
4. Examiner's Comment Regarding Requirement for Deposit
of Biological Material
5. Notice of Informal Patent Application
6. Interview Summary (PTO-413),
Paper No./Mail Date _____.
7. Examiner's Amendment/Comment
8. Examiner's Statement of Reasons for Allowance
9. Other _____.



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 – www.uspto.gov

Examiner's Detailed Office Action

1. Claims 1-30 are allowed.
2. Claims 31-33 have been canceled.

REASONS FOR ALLOWANCE

3. The following is an Examiner's statement for reasons for allowance:
4. The closest art *Whitworth, B.; Felton, R.* ("Whitworth *et al.*") "Measuring disagreement in groups facing limited choice problems System Sciences," Proceedings of the Thirty-First Hawaii International Conference, 1998, does not teach or render obvious applicant's claimed invention. In particular, as pointed out below, the prior art lacks certain features and the combination as specified in the respective claims.
5. With regards to claim 1 *Whitworth et al.* does not disclose determining interval sizes between choice valuations, obtaining a rank for each interval size, using interval size ranks, at least in part, to determine an evaluator score for each choice and combining evaluator scores for each choice to determine, at least in part an overall score for each choice.

6. With regards to claim 18 *Whitworth et al.* does not disclose obtaining ranks of intervals between a valuation-ordered group of choices, determining a score for each choice from the interval ranks, scores for each evaluator to obtain an overall score for each choice.

7. With regards to claim 29 *Whitworth et al.* does not disclose determines a valuation by each of multiple evaluators for each of multiple products, wherein at least one evaluator determines a valuation representing revenue, and another evaluator determines a valuation representing profit, ranking intervals between valuation-ordered product for each evaluator, determining product scores using interval ranks for each evaluator, combining product scores to determine an overall score for each product.

Correspondence Information

8. Any inquires concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Michael B. Holmes, who may be reached Monday through Friday, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. EST. or via telephone at (571) 272-3686 or facsimile transmission (571) 273-3686 or email Michael.holmesb@uspto.gov.

If you need to send an Official facsimile transmission, please send it to (571) 273-8300.

If attempts to reach the examiner are unsuccessful the Examiner's Supervisor, Anthony Knight, may be reached at (571) 272-3687.

Hand-delivered responses should be delivered to the Receptionist @ (Customer Service Window Randolph Building 401 Dulany Street Alexandria, VA 22313), located on the first floor of the south side of the Randolph Building.

Finally, information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the

Art Unit: 2121

Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Moreover, status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have any questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) toll-free @ 1-866-217-9197.

Michael B. Holmes

Patent Examiner

Artificial Intelligence

Art Unit 2121

United States Department of Commerce
Patent & Trademark Office

Tuesday, March 20, 2007

MBH



Anthony Knight
Supervisory Patent Examiner
Group 3600